

ἐλεεῖν) to the view that the soul as a whole (i.e. the person) can be corrupted (from b3, ἀλλ' to the end of the speech) by pleasure.¹³

Urbana

MARC MASTRANGELO
JOHN HARRIS

¹³ We would like to express our gratitude to the editors, the anonymous referee, Professor David Konstan, and Professor William M. Calder III for their perceptive comments and suggestions.

SCENTS AND SENSIBILITY IN PLAUTUS' *CASINA*

When Lysidamus arrives on stage in Plautus' *Casina*, he delightedly announces that he is in love with the slave girl Casina.¹ He is returning, he says, from an expedition to buy perfume which he hopes has made him appealing to his beloved. Casina's name is derived from the fragrant spice *casia*. Cassia and the related spice cinnamon originate in the Far East and were imported to Rome through Arabia or Africa.² Like other ancient spices, cassia was used as perfume, condiment, and in medicinal and religious contexts.³ A Roman audience would have been ready to laugh, or groan, at punning references to fragrant cosmetics or condiments in a play about a woman named Casina. Playing on Casina's aromatic name, the old man asserts that love is the best of all condiments: *neque salsum neque suave esse potest quicquam, ubi amor non admiscetur* (222).⁴ He imagines that his love for Casina works like a cosmetic, making him very appealing indeed: *quom amo Casinam, magis niteo, munditiis Munditiam antideo* (225). When the old man's wife, Cleostrata, smells the perfumes he is wearing (236), she sharply rebukes him: *senecta aetate unguentatus per vias, ignave, incedis?* (240). In her view, the perfume-buying excursion runs counter to the civic values which a *senex* should uphold, as does his erotic pursuit of Casina. When the *Casina* was performed in Rome in 185,⁵ audience reactions to Lysidamus' shopping trip might be affected by prohibitions on the sale of *unguenta exotica* which had been declared by the censors in 189.⁶ In pursuing Casina, Lysidamus is metaphorically pursuing a pleasing scent such as he sought out in the perfume shops. Once Lysidamus' soliloquy and his confrontation with Cleostrata have brought the notion of how things smell into the foreground, the issue continues to come up. The metaphor of smell is used to describe aroused suspicions (266). Olympio, the rustic estate manager whom Lysidamus hoped to marry to Casina, complains at one point

¹ The old man is not named in the play; the name Lysidamus is read in the scene headings in the Ambrosian palimpsest, but may not be Plautine: cf. G. E. Duckworth, 'The unnamed characters in the plays of Plautus', *CP* 33 (1938), 267–82.

² Ancient references to cassia are surveyed by Olck, 'Casia', *RE* 3.2 (1899), 1637–51. For descriptions of cinnamon and cassia see D. J. Mabberly, *The Plant Book: A Portable Dictionary of the Higher Plants* (Cambridge, 1987), s.v. Cinnamomum (pp. 126–7); on the ancient trade in cinnamon and cassia see L. Casson, 'Cinnamon and Cassia in the Ancient World,' in *Ancient Trade and Society* (Detroit, 1984), pp. 225–46. J. Innes Miller, *The Spice Trade of the Roman Empire: 29 B.C. to A.D. 641* (Oxford, 1969), pp. 42–7, 153–72, while perhaps going too far in viewing Pliny's references to traders in rudderless rafts (*H.N.* 12.87–8) as evidence for trade routes between Indonesia and Madagascar, nevertheless provides much of interest.

³ On the range of uses for ancient spices see Miller (above, n. 2), pp. 1–9.

⁴ The pun is cautiously noted by W. T. MacCary and M. M. Willcock, *Plautus, Casina* (Cambridge, 1976), pp. 219, 814 (hereafter MacCary and Willcock).

⁵ MacCary and Willcock, p. 11.

⁶ Pliny *H.N.* 13.24.

about Lysidamus' conversation, hinting at his bad breath: *fu, fu, foetat tuos mihi sermo* (727). The closing lines warn that anyone who does not applaud the play will find that a stinking goat has been substituted for his prostitute (1018). And when Chalinus is about to enter disguised as Casina, someone (probably Pardalisca) puns on the aromatic associations between Casina and cassia, saying that there is already a whiff of 'Casinus' from afar (*iam oboluit Casinus procul*, 814).⁷

Casina's name and the old man's soliloquy are the play's most obvious representations of the phenomenon of scent. Two other characters bear 'fragrant' names, and it is possible to obtain some appreciation of the cultural significances of these scents within what Maria Wyke calls the ancient 'rhetoric of adornment'.⁸ The name of Cleostrata's neighbour Myrrhina is a conventional comic name, borne by women who appear or are mentioned in Aristophanes' *Lysistrata*, Menander's *Dyskolos*, *Georgos*, *Heros*, and *Perikeiromene*, and Terence's *Hecyra*. The conventional name is particularly apt in the *Casina*, where scent is otherwise so much at issue, because, as MacCary and Willcock note in their commentary, the name is derived from the sweet-smelling plant myrtle.⁹ Thus, both Casina and Myrrhina bear names which can evoke pleasing scents.

Pardalisca's name too has aromatic connotations, though these are less obvious to a modern reader than they might have been to some ancient spectators. 'Pardalisca' is the diminutive of the Greek word for leopard or panther, *πάρδαλις*; in modern scientific terms, the correct name is leopard.¹⁰ Of course, Pardalisca's name suggests attractive feline grace. But in explaining the natural history of the *πάρδαλις*, Aristotle and Theophrastus report that it emitted an appealing scent to attract its prey and could therefore hunt therefore simply by lurking and breathing.¹¹ Both Aristotle and Theophrastus emphasize the sweetness of the breath of the *πάρδαλις*, even though they admit that no human has ever been in a position to perceive this alluring scent.¹² Writing in the late second or early third centuries C.E., Aelian makes an explicit connection between the supposed powers of this animal's breath and the erotically

⁷ On the attribution of 814 see MacCary and Willcock, who assign it to Pardalisca.

⁸ M. Wyke, 'Woman in the mirror: the rhetoric of adornment in the Roman world', in L. J. Archer et al. (edd.), *Women in Ancient Societies: An Illusion of the Night* (London, 1994), pp. 134–51.

⁹ MacCary and Willcock, p. 95. On the plant, *myrtus communis*, and its scent, see Mabberly (above, n. 2), s.v. *Myrtus* (p. 388). Cf. P. Chantraine, *Dictionnaire étymologique de la langue grecque* (Paris, 1984), s.v. *μύρτος*. For ancient references to the pleasing scent of myrtle branches and berries, see e.g. Cat. 64.89–90 and S. Lilja, *The Treatment of Odours in the Poetry of Antiquity* (*Commentationes Humanarum Litterarum* 49) (Helsinki, 1972), index s.v. 'myrtle'.

¹⁰ '... in fact, the words "pard" and "panther" are vague, archaic terms that have been used for several large cats, especially the leopard, jaguar and puma. With luck, the confusing term "panther" will die out before the single species, best called the leopard, does,' *The Encyclopedia of Mammals*, vol. 1, ed. D. Macdonald (London, 1984), p. 45.

¹¹ See Arist. *Hist. An.* 612a12–15; [Arist.] *Pr.* 907b 35–37; Theophr. *Caus. Pl.* 6.5.2, 6.17.9; Pliny *H.N.* 8.62, 21.39 (he uses the name *panthera*); Plut. *Mor.* 976d; Ael. *N.A.* 5.40, 8.6. Scent is also central in men's pursuit of the *πάρδαλις*. According to the ancient sources, it is possible to trap and kill the *πάρδαλις* by smearing a piece of meat with aconite, sometimes called *πάρδαλις-choke* (*παρδαλιαγγές*). The *πάρδαλις* then will try to medicate itself. The antidote for aconite, according to the *πάρδαλις*, is human excrement. Therefore, hunters suspend a vessel of excrement in a tree just above the aconite-smearred meat. The poisoned *πάρδαλις* will tire itself to death trying to jump high enough to win what it thinks will cure it. See Arist. *Hist. An.* 612a7–12; Pliny *H.N.* 8.100, and 27.7; cf. Ael. *N.A.* 13.10.

¹² There is an intriguing parallel to the inaccessible sweet scent of the breath of the *πάρδαλις* in Pliny's report that a perfume called *pardalium* was formerly made in Tarsus, but that now it is no longer made and even the recipe has been lost (*H.N.* 13.6).

attractive powers of perfume; he terms the animal's powers of attraction a *ἰνυξ*, a seductive enchantment.¹³ Actually, Aelian is only making explicit what is already implicit in the accounts of Aristotle and Theophrastus, and indeed in the use of 'Pardalisca' as a female slave name. In the light of this peculiar piece of natural history, and the overt emphasis on scents in the *Casina*, the name suggests the mysterious and alluring breath of the *πάρδαλις*. Even Pardalisca's initial insistence on getting very close to Lysidamus may be part of the fun. After she bursts out of the house in pretended fear and he calls her by name (631), she feigns fainting: *ne cadam, amabo, tene me* (634). She tells Lysidamus to fan the air: *face ventum, amabo, pallio* (637). Her breath is surely inescapable when she seductively tells him to take hold of her ears (*optine auris, amabo*, 641)—a position for kissing.¹⁴

Recognizing that Pardalisca's name and stage business have aromatic connotations is easy once the rather esoteric legend of the breath of the *πάρδαλις* is adduced. Myrrhina's name presents a different interpretive problem, simply because myrtle is so familiar and used in so many different ways. In Athens, fragrant myrtle wreaths could be worn at sacrifices, banquets, and weddings, and its berries were a dessert dish.¹⁵ Myrtle's association with the goddess Aphrodite is part of a pattern which connects the plant's appealing scent with sexual desire.¹⁶ In the *Lysistrata*, Aristophanes puts this notion vividly on stage when Myrrhina teases her husband with the prospect of sex (*Lys.* 889–953). In Rome, too, myrtle is associated with Venus and sexual desire.¹⁷ On the Kalends of April, women of the lower ranks bathe and take up myrtle garlands to worship Venus.¹⁸ When women worship the Bona Dea, they are not permitted to bring myrtle, presumably because of its associations with desire.¹⁹

The sheer variety of uses to which the familiar myrtle could be put might make it seem impossible to say anything further about Myrrhina's name except that Aphrodite/Venus' association with myrtle connects the fragrant plant (and therefore the name) with female sexuality. Such a connection no doubt is present when *hetairai* bear the name,²⁰ or when Myrrhina cavorts on stage in the *Lysistrata*, but it seems less

¹³ Ael. *N.A.* 5.40 οὐκοῦν οἱ νεβροὶ καὶ <αἱ> δορκάδες καὶ οἱ αἰγες οἱ ἄγριοι καὶ τὰ τοιαῦτα τῶν ζῴων ὑπὸ τινος ἰνυγος τῆς εὐωδίας ἔλκεται. Cf. M. Detienne, *The Gardens of Adonis: Spices in Greek Mythology*, trans. J. Lloyd (Princeton, 1994), pp. 85–6. The notion of the alluring breath underlies Isidore's etymology of *panther* as 'friend to every (πᾶν) beast' (*Etym.* 12.2.8). Christian allegories interpret the *panthera* (or *pantere*) as Jesus, and the sweet breath as the words which attract his followers. On the panther in medieval bestiaries (which treat the *panther*, the *leopardus*, and the *pardus* as distinct animals, and attribute sweet breath only to the *panther*), see F. McCulloch, *Mediaeval Latin and French Bestiaries* (Chapel Hill, 1962), pp. 148–51. Medieval bestiaries derive from Latin versions of a lost Greek *Physiologus*, probably produced in second century C.E. Alexandria, on which see B. E. Perry, 'Physiologus', *RE* 39 (1941), 1074–1129. For the earliest surviving Latin version see P. T. Eden, *Theobaldi Physiologus* (*Mittelaltersche Studien und Texte* 6) (Leiden, 1972); the account of the *panter* is found in §13 (pp. 70–3).

¹⁴ See *Asinaria* 668, as MacCary and Willcock, ad loc., suggest.

¹⁵ Myrtle wreaths at sacrifices: Aristophanes, *Wasps* 861, *Thesm.* 36–8, *Birds* 43; at banquets: *Ath.* 15.675e; wedding crowns: *Birds* 160–1, with scholia ad loc.; myrtle wreaths worn by civic officials: scholia on *Wasps* 861; myrtle berries as dessert: e.g. *Pl. Resp.* 2.372c, *Ath.* 6.258e = *Diphilus* fr. 79 Edmonds.

¹⁶ On uses of myrtle see P. G. Maxwell-Stuart, 'Myrtle and the Eleusinian mysteries', *WS* 85 (1972), 145–61; Steier, 'Myrtos', *RE* 16.1 (1933), 1171–88.

¹⁷ *Plaut. Vid.* 17; *Verg. Ecl.* 7.62 (on which Servius explains that myrtle covered Aphrodite as she rose out of the sea), *G.* 1.28, *Phaed.* 3.17.3; *Pliny H.N.* 15.121.

¹⁸ *Plut. Num.* 19.2; cf. *Ov. Fast.* 4.139, 143.

¹⁹ *Plut. Mor.* 268e (*Quaest. Rom.* 20).

²⁰ For real women see *Ath.* 13.590c (hetaira of Hyperides), 593a (hetaira of Demetrius Poliorcetes), and for literary representations see *Timocles* fr. 27 Kassel and Austin, *Herodas* 1.89, 2.65.

appropriate to the role of Myrrhina in the *Casina*. However, it may be significant that the comic characters in Aristophanes, Menander, Plautus, and Terence who bear the name Myrrhina are all married women rather than *hetairai* (indeed, to Donatus [*ad Ter. Ad.* 26] the name seemed typical of matrons, just as Pamphilus seemed typical of youths and Thraso of soldiers). Greek and Roman comedies reflect the ancient cultural norms which define two fundamentally different types of female sexuality: that of wives, which produces legitimate children, and that of non-wives, which does not. From Menander onwards in comedy the name Myrrhina is associated with the sexuality that produces legitimate children.

There is little to indicate that Menander is alluding to specific connections between myrtle and marriage. In a Roman context though, some specific (though certainly not exclusive) connections between myrtle and marriage might have been felt, for the elder Cato (*Agr.* 8.2, 133.2) enumerates three categories of myrtle: black (*nigra*), white (*candida*), and connected with marriage (*coniugula*). Pliny reports that when the Sabine men and the Romans reconciled after the rape of the Sabine women, they cleansed their weapons with sprigs of myrtle; the site is now marked by statues of Venus Cluacina, Pliny adds, remarking that *cluere* is an ancient word meaning 'to purify' (*H. N.* 15. 119). Pliny suggests that 'conjugal' myrtle derives from the myrtle sacred to Venus Cluacina (*H. N.* 15.122). The epithet 'conjugal' thus connects myrtle with the foundation of the institution of marriage at Rome. In Rome's civic landscape, the story of this myrtle tree signifies men's transformation of the rape of the Sabine women into marriages and social stability: this transformation took place on the prompting of the Sabine women themselves, who, reconciled to their new lives, stood between the battle lines to prevent their fathers from battling with their husbands. Admittedly, there is no definitive proof that the association of myrtle with the Sabines' reconciliation is as old as the *Casina*. But the citation of Cato and the acknowledgement that *cluere* is an ancient word are suggestive, and it is tempting to see some hint of this 'conjugal myrtle' in Plautus' Myrrhina, who initially counsels Cleostrata to reconcile herself to her husband's behaviour. Upon leaving her house, Myrrhina tells her slaves to summon her if her husband requires her (167). Paradoxically, even by leaving her house she upholds household virtues, for she implies that she will improve her domestic productivity by visiting her friend (168–9) and she checks to see that her distaff is brought along (170). When Cleostrata explains that she is angry at her husband because of his pursuit of her slave girl Casina, Myrrhina asserts that a woman has no property apart from her husband (199–201), and that she should not interfere with his pursuit of other women (206–7). A background of Roman associations of myrtle with conjugal reconciliation could reinforce Myrrhina's explicit acceptance of traditional views of marriage in the early stages of the play.

Still, it remains true that little is made on stage of the 'scented' properties of Myrrhina's name, and perhaps this will lead some to exclude the possibility that her name evokes the familiar and pleasant scent of the myrtle. Certainly, in a play where scent is not in the foreground of the action, the name Myrrhina would not on its own necessarily seem 'fragrant'. But Plautus could have chosen any name for Myrrhina (or given her no name at all), and the name is found nowhere else in his surviving plays. In the *Casina*, where scent is at issue from the first scene, the fact that he chose a name which can evoke a familiar fragrance should be perceived as part of the play's manipulations of the 'rhetoric of adornment.' My suggestion that myrtle may have been already associated with conjugal reconciliation at Rome is more speculative, but such associations would help Myrrhina's scented name make 'sense' more precisely

than it would if it simply evoked the broader associations of myrtle with Venus and sex.

At this point it is appropriate to note that investigations of the *Casina* usually address the issue of its relation to Diphilus' *Kleroumenoi*, which Plautus says is his model (32–4).²¹ Could these aromatic names have originated in Diphilus' play? No names of characters preserved in fragments of Diphilus seem to play similar games. It is also clear from Plautus' adaptation of Menander's *Dis Exapaton* in the *Bacchides* that he could invent new and funnier names for his model's characters. Thus Menander's Syrus is renamed Chrysalus: Chrysalus makes jokes about gold that play on the Greek etymology of his name (*Bacch.* 240, 361–2); and, expressing his own greater ambitions in deceiving his master, says that he disdains 'Parmenos and Syruses who snatch two or three minas from their masters' (*Bacch.* 649–50).²²

Whatever Diphilus may or may not have done, in the *Casina* scents signify the relations of the characters. The aromatic names Pardalisca, Casina, and Myrrhina constitute a spectrum of erotic appeal: the breath of the *πάρδαλις* is alluring, dangerous, and remote from human experience; cassia is an obtainable, though expensive, foreign luxury; myrtle is familiar, appealing, and available close to home. Just as exotic perfumes are not suitable for old men, Casina will elude Lysidamus. Myrrhina, though she aids in Cleostrata's plot against Lysidamus, remains within marriage, at home in the landscape (like myrtle) as she has been all along. Pardalisca, the exotic *πάρδαλις*, excluded from legitimate marriage, will remain an alluring outsider.

University of Washington

CATHERINE CONNORS

²¹ For an overview, see W. T. MacCary, 'The Comic Tradition and Comic Structure in Diphilos' *Kleroumenoi*', *Hermes* 101 (1973), 194–208; see also W. S. Anderson, *Barbarian Play: Plautus' Roman Comedy* (Toronto, 1993), pp. 53–9.

²² So noted by E. W. Handley, *Menander and Plautus: A Study in Comparison* (University of London Inaugural Lecture, London, 1968), p. 9.

THE BOOKS OF PHAEDRUS REQUESTED BY CICERO (*ATT.* 13.39)

Around 16 August of 45 B.C. Cicero wrote a brief letter to Atticus (*Att.* 13.39) in which he reminds Atticus to send the books of the Epicurean scholar Phaedrus that he had requested. The Greek words in the text of his request have been corrupted through the centuries:

Libros mihi de quibus ad te antea scripsi velim mittas et maxime
Φαίδρου περὶ θεῶν et <ΠΑΛΙΔΟΣ>.¹

Based on this passage alone, some have assumed with an unwarranted degree of certainty that Phaedrus wrote a work on the gods. In fact, the manuscripts offer no more than the following enigma:

ΦΑΙΔΡΟΥ ΠΕΡΙΟΧΩΝ et ΠΑΛΙΔΟΣ.

¹ D. R. Shackleton-Bailey (ed.), *Cicero's Letters to Atticus* (Cambridge, 1966), vol. 5 letter 342 (hereafter S-B.); R. Y. Tyrrell and L. C. Purser, *The Correspondence of Cicero* (Dublin, 1915), vol. 5 letter 659.